

NOTES
ON THE TEXT

LIST OF
ILLUSTRATIONS

INDEX

Notes on the text

PART I

THE SHAPE OF HISTORY

1 The relativity of historical thought

¹ Greek text as in E. Diehl, *Anthologia Lyrica*, Leipzig, Teubner, 1922, I, 58–9.

² For the Western World as a whole the close of this preceding age may be equated approximately with the end of the third quarter of the nineteenth century of our era. The idea that the 'sixties and 'seventies of the nineteenth century were a time of transition from one age of our common civilization to another is familiar to continental Europeans and to Americans (both in the United States and in Canada). It is less familiar to people brought up in Great Britain, who usually think of these decades not as the close but as the zenith of an age – the Victorian Age – which began earlier and ended later than this. From the standpoint of Great Britain, that is perhaps the natural view; but it will be suggested below (in ch. 2) that the position of Great Britain in the Western World at that time was exceptional. In the invention of industrialism and 'democracy' the people of Great Britain had been pioneers; and the process by which the supremacy of these two institutions was established was already past history in Great Britain at the time when it was attaining or approaching completion in other parts of the Western World. Hence the people of Great Britain were conscious of relative continuity at a time when the peoples of most other countries in the Western World were conscious of a transition from one age to another. The sense of the majority must be taken as the standard when we are considering the Western World as a whole.

³ On this point, see W. Dilthey, *Gesammelte Schriften*, Leipzig and Berlin, Teubner, 1927, VII. The *Geisteswissenschaften* tend to borrow the methods of the *Naturwissenschaften*, owing to the seniority of these latter disciplines, notwithstanding the fact that their respective *Verfahrungsweisen* differ *ab initio* (p. 130). 'Die realen Kategorien sind . . . in den Geisteswissenschaften nirgends dieselben als in den Naturwissenschaften' (p. 197). The usefulness of a 'scientific methodology' is one of the principal problems of modern sociology; see for example Peter Berger, *Invitation to Sociology: A Humanistic Perspective*, New York, Doubleday, 1963, pp. 11–62.

⁴ It is noteworthy that, while many historians still acquiesce in this régime, the leading minds in the field of contem-

porary physical science have already passed the stage of study in which the industrial system seems to be a fruitful and adequate method of research. Refuting the view that 'scientists are becoming ever narrower and more specialized', P. B. Medawar suggests that 'the opposite is the case. One of the distinguishing marks of modern science is the disappearance of sectarian loyalties. . . . Isolationism is over; we all depend upon and sustain each other' ('Two Conceptions of Science', reprinted in *The Art of the Soluble*, London, Methuen, 1967, pp. 111–28.)

⁵ 'Established', that is, in the subjective meaning of the French verb *constater*.

⁶ See Eduard Meyer, 'Der Gang der alten Geschichte' in *Kleine Schriften*, Halle, Niemeyer, 1910; and *Blüte und Niedergang des Hellenismus in Asien*, Berlin, Curtius, 1925. In another place, Meyer points out that the historian's access to historical evidence is always and everywhere at the mercy of chance, so that there is no rational correspondence between the intrinsic importance and interest of any given historical event and the quantity and credibility of the historical evidence that is at our disposal for the study of it (*Geschichte des Altertums*, 4th edition, Stuttgart and Berlin, Cotta, 1921, I (i), 211–12).

⁷ The pioneers of today in the field of physical science would probably admit this description as being true of the *laboratorium* of their 'classical' predecessors, but would indignantly – and perhaps justly – deny that their own work was being conducted on 'classical' principles or under the shadow of 'classical' traditions.

⁸ See Bergson's inquiry into the 'Fonction Primordiale de l'Intelligence' in *L'Évolution Créatrice*, 24th edition, Paris, Alcan, 1921, pp. 164–79. In this suggestion, Bergson has been anticipated by Turgot. See the 'Plan de Deux Discours sur l'Histoire Universelle' in *Œuvres de Turgot*, nouvelle édition, 2 vols., Paris, Guillaumin, 1844, II, 626–8.

⁹ Bergson (see n. 8), especially ch. 3.

¹⁰ Camille Jullian, *De la Gaule à la France: Nos Origines Historiques*, Paris, Hachette, 1922.

¹¹ Jullian (see n. 10), ch. 2, p. 62, 'L'Époque des Agriculteurs (Temps Néolithiques)'.

¹² H. W. V. Temperley's masterly *History of Serbia*, London, Bell, 1917, illustrates the difficulties with which a historian

has to contend in attempting to write a history of a nation of this calibre. In order to make Serbian history intelligible and consecutive, he has to present it within the successive frameworks of Byzantine and Ottoman history and finally in relation to the 'Eastern Question': that is to say, as a function of the modern European balance of power. There are few chapters in which he succeeds in disengaging Serbian history from its context and treating it in isolation.

2 The field of historical study

- 1 See Part XI, ch. 53, pp. 486-7, below.
- 2 Virgil, *Eclogues*, I, 66: 'And the Britons totally cut off from all the rest of the world.'
- 3 i.e. 'a second world'; see E. A. Freeman, *Historical Essays*, fourth series, London, Macmillan, 1891, ix, 'Alter Orbis'.
- 4 Marc Bloch, *Feudal Society*, London, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1961, pp. 181-9.
- 5 In a lecture on Henry IV and Richelieu, printed in *Lectures on Modern History*, London, Macmillan, 1906.
- 6 Eric Hobsbawm, *Industry and Empire*, London, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1968, p. 21.
- 7 The only Spartan overseas colony was Tarentum, and the foundation of Tarentum appears to have been an exceptional measure.
- 8 See M. P. Nilsson, 'Die Grundlagen des spartanischen Lebens' in *Klio*, xii, 1912.
- 9 Thucydides II, 41.
- 10 See Part IV, ch. 23, p. 173, below.

3 Some definitions of terms

- 1 F. A. Hayek, *The Counter-Revolution of Science*, London, Allen and Unwin, 1952, p. 34.
- 2 Presumably derived from the simile in the New Testament in which the adherents of the Christian Church are spoken of as members of the body of Christ (e.g. 1 Cor. vi. 15; Eph. v. 30).
- 3 P. Bagby, *Culture and History*, London, Longmans, 1958, pp. 84 and 95.
- 4 Bagby (see n. 3), p. 124.
- 5 A. L. Kroeber, *The Nature of Culture*, Chicago, University Press, 1952, p. 104.
- 6 Bagby (see n. 3), pp. 162-3.
- 7 See H. Frankfort's criticism of Childe's phrase in *The Birth of Civilization in the Near East*, London, Williams and Norgate, 1951, pp. 57-8 and p. 57, n. 2.
- 8 R. Redfield, in *The Primitive World and its Transformations*, Ithaca N.Y., Cornell University Press, 1953, equates civilization with the rise of cities (p. ix) on the ground that it was in the cities that 'the administrative élite', 'the literate priest', and 'the specialized artisan' made their first appearance (p. 30).
- 9 Frankfort (see n. 7), pp. 7-8.
- 10 A. N. Whitehead, *Adventures of Ideas*,

- Cambridge, University Press, 1933, pp. 13-14.
- 11 Christopher Dawson, *The Dynamics of World History*, London, Sheed and Ward, 1957, p. 41.
- 12 The Western statue must be pre-Renaissance if it is to be characteristic and distinctive. It must antedate the Western reception, at 'the' Renaissance, of the Hellenic style of visual art.
- 13 A. L. Kroeber, *Style and Civilizations*, Ithaca N.Y., Cornell University Press, 1957, pp. 2-3 and 155-6.
- 14 Kroeber (see n. 5), p. 402.
- 15 Kroeber (see n. 5), p. 403.
- 16 Kroeber (see n. 13), p. 150.
- 17 Bagby (see n. 3), p. 108.
- 18 Bagby (see n. 3), pp. 108-9.
- 19 Frankfort (see n. 7), p. 16.
- 20 Bagby (see n. 3), p. 109.

4 The need for a comprehensive study of human affairs

- 1 M. R. Cohen, *The Meaning of Human History*, La Salle, Open Court Publishing Company, 1947, p. 210.
- 2 J. Needham, *Science and Civilization in China*, Cambridge, University Press, 1954, II, 336; and C. Lévi-Strauss, *The Savage Mind*, London, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1966.
- 3 Among many other contemporary observers, Jan Romein testifies that, in our day, 'one world or none' is the truth about our situation (M. F. A. Montagu (editor), *Toynbee and History*, Boston, Porter Sargent, 1956, p. 350).
- 4 This point has been made by Polybius in his *Ecumenical History* I, 4: 'The coincidence by which all the transactions of the world have been oriented in a single direction and guided towards a single goal is the extraordinary characteristic of the present age, to which the special feature of the present work is a corollary. The unity of events imposes on the historian a similar unity of composition in depicting for his readers the operation of the laws of Fortune on the grand scale, and this has been my own principal inducement and stimulus in the work which I have undertaken.'
- 5 R. Coulborn in *Phylon*, 1940, offprint, p. 62.
- 6 'Die Erkenntnis der Geschichte der Menschheit soll ein Gemeingut der Menschheit sein': a fragment written by Ranke in the 1860s, printed on pp. xiii-xvi of A. Dove's preface to the Ninth Part, Second Section, of Ranke's *Weltgeschichte*, 9 parts, Leipzig, Duncker and Humblot, 1881-8. The passage here quoted is on pp. xv-xvi.
- 7 In a critique of my work, J. Romein judges that I am right in thinking that the unity of the world is now in the making. As Romein puts it, world unity has been created by the technicians; we have now to raise this technological unity to the level of creativity (*Toynbee and History* (see n. 3), p. 350).

5 The transitional societies

- 1 See Part IV, ch. 20, p. 155, below.
- 2 Jacquetta Hawkes and Sir Leonard Woolley, *History of Mankind*, published for the International Commission for a History of the Scientific and Cultural Development of Mankind, London, Allen and Unwin, 1963, I, 363-4.
- 3 Hawkes and Woolley (see n. 2), p. 414.
- 4 Hawkes and Woolley (see n. 2), p. 466.
- 5 V. G. Childe, *What Happened in History*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1942, p. 70.
- 6 Hawkes and Woolley (see n. 2), p. 597.
- 7 Hawkes and Woolley (see n. 2), p. 419.
- 8 R. J. Braidwood, *The Near East and the Foundations of Civilization*, Eugene, Oregon State System of Higher Education, 1952, p. 16.
- 9 Braidwood (see n. 8), p. 5.
- 10 F. Borkenau in *Mercur*, July 1949, p. 629.
- 11 Braidwood (see n. 8), p. 42.
- 12 Braidwood (see n. 8), pp. 5-6 and 42.
- 13 Borkenau (see n. 10), p. 631. It is noteworthy that, in Peru as well, technological progress was characteristic of the Formative Age (W. C. Bennett, 'A Re-appraisal of Peruvian Archaeology', p. 6, in *Memoirs of the Society for American Archaeology*, Menasha Wisc., 1948, pp. 121-2).
- 14 Borkenau (see n. 10), p. 630.
- 15 V. G. Childe, *Man Makes Himself*, London, Watts, 1936, p. 122.
- 16 In the Andean World as well, the transition from the Formative Age to the Classic Age, in which the valley bottoms in coastal Peru were mastered and irrigated, was accompanied by a shift in interest from technology to the social and political enterprise of manipulating manpower (W. C. Bennett and J. B. Bird, *Andean Culture History*, American Museum of Natural History Handbook Series no. 15, New York, 1949, pp. 181-2; W. C. Bennett in 'A Reappraisal of Peruvian Archaeology' (see n. 13), p. 6).
- 17 Childe (see n. 15), p. 120-2.
- 18 In Egypt the whole land was owned by a single god incarnate, Pharaoh. In Sumer it was parcelled out among the territories of a number of independent city-states, and each of these city-state territories contained the estates of several gods. These Sumerian gods were not incarnate.
- 19 Braidwood (see n. 8), p. 37. Compare page 39 and also page 35: 'Fig. 25: Physiographical and rainfall map of Nuclear Western Asia, with major sites of occurrence of Ubaid phase antiquities or of materials judged to be contemporary with the Ubaid phase.' This was the phase in which the alluvium of the Lower Tigris-Euphrates basin was occupied by Man (p. 36).
- 20 Childe (see n. 5), pp. 79-80.
- 21 R. Redfield, *The Primitive World and its Transformations*, Ithaca N.Y., Cornell University Press, 1953, p. 6.
- 22 Childe (see n. 5), p. 80.

6 The comparative study of civilizations

¹ This obvious but fundamental point is made by H.E. Barnes in *An Introduction to the History of Sociology*, Chicago, University Press, 1948, p. 732.

² G. Buchdahl, in *The Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, December 1956, p. 168, quotes a dictum of Newton's about Newton's own method of work: 'In this philosophy, propositions are deduced from phenomena and afterwards made general by induction.' Buchdahl labels Newton's first step 'the inductive process' and the second step 'the inductive inference'.

³ I hold, as Bagby holds, that 'we shall only be able to judge our scheme when we have applied it to the actual facts of history and seen what results it gives us' (*Culture and History*, London, Longmans, 1958, p. 202).

7 Hellenic and Chinese models

¹ M.R. Cohen, *The Meaning of Human History*, La Salle, Open Court Publishing Company, 1947, p. 114.

² This view has certainly been widely held among Egyptologists in the past. However, E.J. Baumgartel, in *The Cultures of Prehistoric Egypt*, revised edition, London, Oxford University Press, 1955, p. 12, maintains that 'it is not generally recognized that the nomes are survivals of pre-Menite states.'

³ T.A. Sumberg questions 'whether churches are universally the link between the death and birth of related civilizations' (*Social Research*, September 1947, pp. 267-84).

⁴ Sinic history, by itself, offers all the necessary data for constructing the improved model. If Chinese scholars had not done violence to early Chinese history in their excessive zeal for symmetry and self-consistency, it would not have been necessary to resort to an Hellenic model, as we have had to do in order to correct the traditional Chinese misrepresentation of the configuration of early Chinese history.

⁵ H. Frankfort points out that, if we view Egyptian history through Hellenic and Western spectacles, we shall fail to see it as it really was (*The Birth of Civilization in the Near East*, London, Williams and Norgate, 1951, pp. 27-31). As Frankfort sees it, 'the ideal of a marvellously integrated society had been formed long before the Pyramids were built; it was as nearly realized, when they were built, as any ideal social form can be translated into actuality; and it remained continuously before the eyes of rulers and people alike during subsequent centuries. It was an ideal which ought to thrill a Western historian by its novelty, for it falls entirely outside the experience of Greek or Roman or modern Man,

although it survives, in an attenuated form, in Africa. It represents a harmony between Man and the divine which is beyond our boldest dreams, since it was maintained by divine power which had taken charge of the affairs of Man in the person of Pharaoh. Society moved in unison with Nature. Justice, which was the social aspect of the cosmic order, pervaded the commonwealth' (pp. 27-31). Frankfort's thesis that the Egyptians' 'polity was not imposed but evolved from immemorial predilections' (p. 99) is convincing. On the other hand, when Frankfort goes on to say that this polity 'was adhered to, without protest, for almost three thousand years', his contention here is contradicted by the evidence of the surviving Egyptian literature of the age of the Middle Kingdom. This testifies that the ideology of the Old Kingdom régime, and the measures (e.g. pyramid-building) through which this ideology was put into practice, did eventually provoke a moral reaction that went to the length of political revolution in the last days of the Sixth Dynasty.

⁶ This exceptional case is underlined by K.W. Erdmann in *Archiv für Kulturgeschichte*, 1951, pp. 174-250, on pp. 224-5.

⁷ This economic revolution was made possible by an advance, not in the realm of technology, but in the realm of politics (see ch. 5, pp. 48-52, above).

⁸ E.A. Thompson (editor and translator), *A Roman Reformer and Inventor: De Rebus Bellicis*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1952.

8 A Jewish model

¹ During this period, there were states - e.g. the Kingdom of Adiabene and the Khazar Empire - in which the royal family and some of their grandees were converts to Judaism. There were also oases in the Hijaz and fastnesses in Abyssinia, the Caucasus, and the Crimea in which converts to Judaism held their own, perhaps with some admixture of Jewish refugees. But only a minority of the Jews in the world ever lived, or ever could have lived, in these holes and corners.

² The stimulus of penalizations is discussed in Part II, ch. 16, below.

³ In the case of the Lebanese, this has been true *de jure* as well as *de facto* since the establishment, in 1861, of an autonomous vilayet of the Lebanon which became the Lebanese Republic in 1920.

⁴ The present worldwide Lebanese diaspora mostly dates from times subsequent to 1861, i.e. from the period in which the Lebanese people have had a state of their own. Since 1861, the one great ordeal to which they have been subjected has been the Turkish blockade during the First World War.

⁵ This has been one of the spurs by which the Irish, too, have been driven abroad. But, unlike the Scots and the

Lebanese, the Irish have been driven by political oppression as well.

⁶ R. Redfield, *The Primitive World and its Transformations*, Ithaca N.Y., Cornell University Press, 1953, p. 49.

9 A survey of civilizations

¹ The rival claims of unity and diversity in African history are controversial. In the chart on page 72 a practical chronological distinction has been made between East and West Africa; but the question is still open. For a discussion of it, see Basil Davidson, *The Africans*, London, Longmans, 1969, pp. 36-41, and references.

² See P.L. Shinnie (editor), *The African Iron Age*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1971.

³ See P.L. Shinnie, *Meroe*, London, Thames and Hudson, 1967, pp. 165-9.

⁴ See J.S. Trimingham, *The Influence of Islam upon Africa*, London, Longmans, 1968.

⁵ See J.S. Trimingham, *Islam in West Africa*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1959; *A History of Islam in West Africa*, Oxford, University of Glasgow Press, 1962; *Islam in East Africa*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1964.

⁶ See J. Desmond Clark, *The Prehistory of Africa*, London, Thames and Hudson, 1970, pp. 219-22.

⁷ See Lucy Mair, *Primitive Government*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1962, p. 9.

⁸ See Part I, ch. 3, pp. 43-4, above.

⁹ See Brian Fagan, *Southern Africa during the Iron Age*, London, Thames and Hudson, 1965.

¹⁰ See Davidson (n. 1), pp. 35-6.

¹¹ See ch. 3, p. 44, above.

¹² See C. Daryll Forde (editor), *African Worlds: Studies in the Cosmological Ideas and Social Values of African Peoples*, London, Oxford University Press, 1954.

¹³ See Davidson (n. 1), pp. 54-67, and pp. 137-42.

¹⁴ For the notion of 'challenge-and-response', see Part II, ch. 13, p. 97, below.

¹⁵ See Part III, ch. 18, below.

¹⁶ See Davidson (n. 1), pp. 235-43.

¹⁷ In each case the pre-universal-state phase of the civilization, if there was such a phase (and in most cases there was), has been distinguished from the universal-state phase, if the civilization in question ever entered into that phase. For this purpose the universal-state phase has been taken as including all successive avatars of the original universal state, in cases in which this was reconstituted either once, or more than once, after a temporary lapse, or repeated temporary lapses, into political disunity. In cases (e.g. those of the Aegean Civilization and the Indus Civilization) in which we do not know whether the society did or did not ever enter into the universal-state phase, this civilization's total time-span has been marked uniformly in a different shading again.

In cases of affiliation the interregnum between the submergence of the ante-

cedent civilization and the emergence of the affiliated civilization has been included in the time-spans of both civilizations, instead of being excluded from both. This has been done in order to make it clear that the time-spans of the two civilizations overlapped below the surface.

The time-span of the five Christian and Islamic civilizations has been reckoned as starting from the date at which Islam and each of the four main Christian sects began to make mass-conversions. The starting-dates of the Christian and Islamic civilizations have, of course, to be distinguished clearly from the starting-dates of the two religions, Christianity and Islam, themselves. During the first three or four centuries of these two religions' existence, which were their formative centuries, their adherents amounted numerically to no more than a diaspora scattered among a majority that professed other religions; and the religion of a minority can inspire a community to maintain its identity without the prop of a national territory of its own, but it cannot provide the framework or basis for a new civilization. The eventual mass-conversions made the emergence of Christian and Islamic civilizations possible for the first time. The Islamic diaspora became a ruling minority within twenty years of the *hijrah*, whereas the Christian diaspora remained a subject minority until not much less than three hundred years after the crucifixion. But the political difference is not to the point. The religion of a ruling minority is no more capable than the religion of a subject minority is of serving as the matrix of a new civilization. In the age in which the Umayyad and 'Abbasid Caliphate was at its zenith, there was an Islamic political Power but not yet an Islamic society constituting a civilization.

18 By far the greater part of our information about the Middle American and Andean Civilizations is archaeological. The archaeological evidence enables us to distinguish local cultures within each of these two civilizations, and different stages in the history of each of them. On the other hand, the archaeologists have not yet reached firm conclusions about the datings. As recently as 1958, the beginning of the 'classic' phase in Middle America and in Peru—i.e. the beginning of the phase which, in the history of the Old World, we call 'civilization'—was dated, at the earliest, later than the beginning of the Christian Era. In 1971, the zenith of the Middle American Olmec culture was dated 1150–900 B.C. by Professor Michael D.Coe, in the light of excavations conducted by him in 1966–68 at San Lorenzo, on the isthmus of Tehuantepec—a site that seems to have been the Olmec culture's earliest centre. In the chart on page 72 of the present work, the beginning of civilization (i.e. of the 'classic' phase of culture) in both the Middle American and the Andean region is still placed at the beginning of the Christian Era, with question-marks to allow for the possibil-

ity that its true date may prove to have been earlier than 1000 B.C.

19 The Babylonian last phase of the distinctive civilization of the Lower Tigris-Euphrates basin was still Sumerian in its inspiration. Assurbanipal's library was stocked with texts in the Sumerian language and with glossaries of it. But it would, nevertheless, be misleading to apply the label 'Sumerian' to the civilization current in Assyria and Babylonia in the seventh century B.C., considering that, by that date, the Sumerian language had been a 'dead' language for more than a thousand years. Since the age of Hammurabi the Semitic Akkadian language had replaced the Sumerian language as the living vehicle of the Sumerian Civilization. Therefore, Sumerian-Akkadian is a more illuminating label than 'Sumerian' for the whole span of a civilization that did not lose its identity till the first century of the Christian Era.

20 This covers not only the 'Minoan' society, but also the contemporary 'Helladic' variant of the Aegean Civilization in continental European Greece, as well as the 'Mycenaean' last phase of both 'Minoan' and 'Helladic'.

21 The African Civilizations are not the only ones that have been drawn into such an intimate relationship with the Western Civilization since the closing decades of the seventeenth century. It may be thought more accurate to describe them all as 'satellites' rather than 'affiliates' of the West. Today it might be hard to find any living non-Western society, either of the civilizational or of the pre-civilizational kind, that has not been drawn into the orbit of the Western Civilization to some degree, either voluntarily or involuntarily. This relation between them and the West may, however, turn out to have been only a phase, judging by what happened after the Syriac Civilization had been drawn into the field of the Hellenic. In the light of this historical precedent it seems possible that the civilizations of the West and its satellites may blend into a new ecumenical civilization drawing contributions from all of them.

22 i.e. a Pre-Columbian civilization in what is now the south-west of the United States.

23 In what are now Ecuador and Columbia.

24 In what are now northern Chile and north-western Argentina.

25 Elam is the basin of the Karkheh and Karun rivers in present-day Iran, adjoining the lower basin of the Tigris and Euphrates rivers in present-day Iraq. Is the Elamite culture to be classified, not simply as a local cultural province of the Sumerian-Akkadian Civilization, but as a distinct civilization affiliated to the Sumerian-Akkadian? The grounds for classifying it as a separate civilization are its language, which is not related either to Sumerian or to Akkadian Semitic, and its native script. But the invention of this script may have been inspired by an

acquaintance with the Sumerian script, and during some important periods of Elamite history a version of the Sumerian-Akkadian script was used for conveying the Elamite language.

26 The civilization labelled 'Hittite' in this book would have been described more adequately by a geographical name like the Aegean, Andean, and Middle American Civilizations. This Civilization's domain was Asia Minor (in present-day Turkey), but to call it 'Asian' or 'Asiatic' would have been confusing, since the word 'Asia' has come to stand for a whole continent, and no longer just for Asia Minor. The Hittites, including the Indo-European-speaking Hittites' local predecessors, occupied only one of this Anatolian civilization's provinces, and the civilization had reached, and perhaps passed, its zenith before the Indo-European Hittites and Luvians (the Hittites' western neighbours) had arrived in Asia Minor.

27 Urartu (the name of this country survives in the name of Mount Ararat) coincides in area approximately with the eastern end of present-day Turkey together with the present-day Soviet Republic of Erivan. The heart of the Kingdom of Urartu (ninth to seventh centuries B.C.) was the basin of Lake Van, but Urartu also included the upper basins of the river Aras and the river Euphrates, i.e. both arms of the Upper Euphrates.

28 The area of the Meroitic Civilization extended from the First Cataract of the Nile upstream to at least as far as the Sixth Cataract, and perhaps included the Jezirah ('Island') between the White and Blue Niles as well as the country between the Blue Nile and the Atbara. This area coincides approximately with the present-day Egyptian piece of Nubia, together with the northern part of the present-day Sudan. The area as a whole was called Ethiopia by the Greeks and Romans. The present-day Ethiopia (alias Abyssinia) lay outside it. The Pharaonic Egyptian Empire had extended as far up the Nile as the Fourth Cataract in the period of the Eighteenth Dynasty. The Kingdom of Ethiopia was never united with Egypt politically after 654 B.C. The Meroitic Civilization gradually developed distinctive features of its own, and it also expanded its domain southwards.

29 This would be a civilization common to the Etruscan immigrants into Italy in the last millennium B.C. and the peoples previously established in Italy. The common elements in their civilization (e.g. literacy in the Cumaeen alphabet) were of Hellenic origin. The indebtedness of the civilization of Italy in the Hellenic Age to the Hellenic Civilization was so great that it seems more instructive to regard Italy as having been, in this age, a province of the Hellenic World rather than a satellite of it.

30 Including the Mongol and Calmuck converts to the Tibetan form of Mahayana Buddhism.

31 See Part II, ch. 17, below.

PART II

THE GENESES OF CIVILIZATIONS

10 The nature of the geneses of civilizations

1 In this study, the Greek word *mimesis*, from *mimēsthai*, is used in order to avoid the connotations of 'unintelligent imitation' which attach to the derivative English word 'mimicry'. *Mimesis*, as used here, denotes social imitation 'without prejudice'.

2 The historical importance of *mimesis* was discerned by David Hume, as witness the following passage in his essay *Of National Characters*: 'The human mind is of a very imitative nature; nor is it possible for any set of men to converse often together, without acquiring a similitude of manners, and communicating to each other their vices as well as virtues. The propensity to company and society is strong in all rational creatures; and the same disposition which gives us this propensity, makes us enter deeply into each other's sentiments, and causes like passions and inclinations to run, as it were, by contagion through the whole club or knot of companions.'

3 Walter Bagehot, *Physics and Politics*, 10th edition, London, Kegan Paul, 1894, pp. 27 and 35.

4 On this point see Bagehot (n. 3), p. 42.

5 Tacitus, *Agricola*, 45.

6 Ps. cvii. 10.

7 J.C. Smuts, *The League of Nations: A Practical Suggestion*, London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1918, p. 71.

8 Herbert Spencer, *First Principles*, 4th edition.

9 G.W.F. Hegel, *Phänomenologie des Geistes*.

10 *Œuvres de Saint-Simon et d'Enfantin*, Paris, Leroux, 1877, XLI, 86-7, 170-2, 177, 179, 205.

11 William Blake, 'The Marriage of Heaven and Hell'.

12 They are always mentioned in this order - Yin, the static condition, first, and Yang, the dynamic activity, second - and never the other way round.

13 Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Faust*, ll. 12104-11: 'All that is transitory is only an image; the imperfect here becomes achievement; the ineffable is performed; the eternal spirit of womanhood draws us onward.'

14 Goethe, *Faust*, ll. 501-9: 'In floods of life, in the storm of action, I surge up and down, I weave to and fro! Birth and grave an eternal sea, a shuttling weaving, a glowing life - thus I work at the roaring loom of time, and make a living vesture for the Godhead.'

11 The cause of genesis: race?

1 See Part IX, ch. 49, pp. 434-6, below.

2 This is not to say that the condition of non-white populations under white rule in Spanish and Portuguese Africa and in Latin America is happier than the condition of non-white populations that were formerly under British or American rule. On the contrary, the condition of the non-white populations in the Hispanic countries and their present or former colonies, in the Old World and the New, is probably almost everywhere the less happy of the two. This, however, is because the Spanish- and Portuguese-speaking peoples of the Western World are at present on the whole in a less happy condition themselves than the English-speaking peoples. As far as the non-white populations in the Hispanic countries suffer, they suffer equally with their white fellow countrymen of the same social classes; that is to say, they suffer from the prevailing political disorders and economic injustices - but not from any racial discrimination.

12 Environment?

1 *Influences of Atmosphere, Water, and Situation*, ch. 13.

2 Herodotus II, 33.

3 1 Cor. xiii. 2.

4 O.H.K. Spate in *The Geographical Journal*, December 1952, p. 419.

5 *The Social Sciences in Historical Study*, New York, Social Science Research Council, 1954, p. 119.

13 Challenge-and-response

1 See Part I, ch. 1, p. 34, above.

2 In Easter week, 1931, when I wrote the first version of the present chapter, I fancied that the phrase 'challenge-and-response' was a new coinage of my own; but, about a dozen years after I had first put it on paper, I came upon it in the fourth stanza of Robert Browning's 'Master Hugues of Saxe-Gotha'.

O you may challenge them, not a response.

Get the church-saints on their rounds!

The collocation of the two words must have lain submerged on some subconscious level of my mind for a quarter of a century since the Christmas holidays of 1905-06, when I had first read the poem with my mother. When I fancied that I was inventing this phrase, I was really hauling it up from the hold of my memory.

3 A.C.B. Lovell, *The Individual and the Universe: B.B.C. Reith Lectures 1958*, London, Oxford University Press, 1959, pp. 23-4.

4 e.g. the catalogue in the *Odyssey* XI, 225-332, a passage which is probably a fair sample of the lost Hesiodic *Ehoiai*.

5 *Mephistopheles*: 'Von Zeit zu Zeit seh' ich den Alten gern' (*Faust*, l. 350).

6 *Faust*, ll. 249-50: 'God's works, sublime beyond all understanding, are glorious, as they were in the beginning.'

7 Job i. 1-5.

8 Matt. xiii. 24-30.

9 Pierre Teilhard de Chardin, *The Phenomenon of Man*, London, Collins, 1959, p. 164.

10 *Faust*, ll. 340-3: 'Man's activity can all too easily slumber, he is eager for unlimited repose; so I gladly give him a companion who stirs up and works up and perforce, in a devil's way, creates.' In the oddly different language of rationalism, precisely the same idea is expressed by Turgot in his 'Plan de Deux Discours sur l'Histoire Universelle': 'La Raison et la Justice, mieux écoutées, auraient tout fixé, comme cela est à peu près arrivé à la Chine. . . . Le genre humain serait resté à jamais dans la médiocrité. . . . Mais ce qui n'est jamais parfait ne doit jamais être entièrement fixé. Les passions tumultueuses dangereuses, sont devenues un principe d'action, et par conséquent de progrès' (*Œuvres de Turgot*, nouvelle édition, 2 vols., Paris, Guillaumin, 1844, II, 632). Turgot has had a presentiment of the French Revolution nearly half a century before the date of its outbreak.

11 *Faust*, ll. 1338-44: 'I am the spirit who always rejects! I am in the right; for everything that comes up deserves to go under: so, if nothing came up, that would be better. It follows that everything that you call sin, destruction, or, in one word, evil, is my native element.'

12 *Faust*, ll. 11575-6: 'He alone earns freedom and life itself who has to win them daily.'

13 *Faust*, ll. 249-50, quoted above, p. 100, and n. 6 thereto.

14 2 Cor. iii. 18.

15 2 Cor. iii. 17.

16 *Faust*, ll. 1566-9: 'The god who dwells in my breast can arouse my innermost being to its depths; he reigns over all the forces within me; yet he is powerless to move anything outside.'

17 Matt. xiii. 27-30.

18 Euripides, *Hippolytus*, ll. 1327-30, Gilbert Murray's translation, London, Allen and Unwin, 1902.

19 Murray (sec n. 18), ll. 1420-2.

20 V. Grönbech, *The Culture of the Teutons*, London, Oxford University Press, 1931, Part II, p. 302.

21 *Faust*, ll. 312-17.

22 *Faust*, ll. 1692-1706: *Faust*. If ever I lay me down contentedly on a sluggard's bed, let me be done for, straight away! If you can ever cajole and delude me into feeling satisfied with myself, if you can inveigle me with enjoyment, let that be my last day! It is a bet. Will you take it? *Mephistopheles*. Done! *Faust*. And stroke on stroke! If I say to the fleeting moment: 'Do tarry! You are so beautiful!', then

you may clap fetters on me, then I will gladly go under! Then the death knell may peal, then you are free from your service, the clock may stop, its hand may fall, time may, for me, be ended!

23 See ch. 10, p. 86, above.

24 The hint of a future reversal of fortune which is darkly conveyed in 'it shall bruise thy head and thou shalt bruise his heel' is hardly more comforting than Artemis' assurance to Hippolytus that he shall become the object of a cult and the hero of a song (*Hippolytus*, ll. 1423-30).

25 Luke xxii. 53.

26 John xix. 11.

27 R.H.J. Steuart, *The Inward Vision*, London, Longmans, 1930, pp. 62-3. An expression of the same truth, in remarkably similar language, from the standpoint of a contemporary psychologist, will be found in C.G. Jung, *Modern Man in Search of a Soul*, London, Kegan Paul, 1933, pp. 274-5.

28 *Faust*, I. 336: 'I grant you, here too, only a *show* of freedom.'

29 *Faust*, I. 343, quoted above, p. 100, and n. 10 thereto.

30 *Faust*, II. 1335-6: 'A portion of that force which always wills evil and always works good.'

31 *Faust*, II. 337-9: 'I have never hated such as you are. Of all the spirits that reject, the knave is the least irksome to Me.'

32 *Faust*, II. 11167-843.

33 *Faust*, II. 11581-2 and 11585-6: 'I should like to say to the fleeting moment: "Do tarry! You are so beautiful!" In anticipation of such sublime bliss, I enjoy the supreme moment *now*.'

34 Grönbech (sec n. 20), Part II, pp. 331 and 332.

35 This is the motif of the Syriac myth (preserved in Gen. xxxii. 24-32) of the mysterious being - man or angel or demon or God Himself - who assails Jacob before dawn and, in doing so, goes out of his way to bring about his own discomfiture. The assailant, in virtue of his nature, must be gone before dawn; and when he fails to overcome Jacob's resistance and break free - even after using his supernatural power in the hope of putting Jacob out of action - he is driven to confess that Jacob has prevailed and to comply with Jacob's terms: 'I will not let thee go except thou bless me.'

36 It would seem to follow that, if the Devil had known his business, he would have played just the opposite game. Instead of naïvely vaunting his own ability to ruin one of God's creatures - a Faust or a Job - he would have hypocritically chimed in with the Archangels in hymning the omnipotence of God and the perfection of His works. His song would have been not a candid satire on God's chief creation, Man,

Der kleine Gott der Welt bleibt stets
von gleichem Schlag,
Und ist so wunderbar als wie am ersten
Tag

(This world's godling stays always true

to form; he is as amazing as he was on the first day), but a disingenuous

God's in His Heaven,
All's right with the World.

37 Ps. cii. 25-7.

38 *Faust*, II. 510-17; compare lines 1744-7: *Faust*. Thou who dost encircle the wide world, thou active spirit, how near I feel myself to thee. *Spirit*. You are like the spirit whom you understand; you are not like me (*vanishes*). *Faust* (*collapsing*). Not like thee! Like whom, then? I have been made in God's image, and I am not even like thee!

39 Isa. liii. 3.

40 Plato, *Republica*, II, 361E-362A.

41 *Faust*, II. 354-417.

42 *Faust*, II. 418-517.

43 Job iii.

44 *Faust*, I. 4596.

45 *Faust*, II. 2607-8.

46 *Faust*, II. 3376-413:

My peace is past,
My heart is sore;
I shall find my peace never,
Nevermore.

47 Dream of a woman undergoing an operation under insufficient ether, cited by William James in *The Varieties of Religious Experience*, 33rd impression, London, Longmans, 1922, pp. 392-3.

48 Matt. iii. 13-14 and iv. 11; Mark i. 9-13; Luke iii. 2-22 and iv. 1-13.

49 The non-violence of Jesus and his followers, and its contrast with the militancy of the abortive messianic movements of a Theudas or a Judas of Galilee, did not escape the observation of Gamaliel (Acts v. 34-40).

50 Job iii.

51 *Faust*, II. 418-521.

52 *Faust*, II. 602-807.

53 *Faust*, II. 1224-37.

54 *Faust*, II. 1583-1606.

55 *Faust*, II. 1607-26: 'Woe! Woe! Thou hast destroyed it - destroyed this beautiful world - destroyed it with mighty fist; it crashes, it falls to pieces! A demigod has shattered it! We bear its ruins away into the void, and we lament over the beauty that has been lost. Mighty one among the sons of Earth, build the world again, grander than before; build it up within thine own breast! Start a new course of life with radiant sentience, and let new songs ring out in answer.'

56 *Faust*, II. 1627-8.

57 Grönbech (sec n. 20), Part II, p. 302. There is a curious congruity between the language of the anonymous author of the *Voluspá* and Virgil's language in the *Georgics* I, 505-11:

A world where right spells wrong, and
wrong spells right!
So many wars! So many shapes of
crime!
The plough despised! The ploughmen
reft away!
The widowed fields unkempt! The
sickle's curve

Melted to mould a sword-blade's stiff
straight edge . . .

Neighbours break bonds of friendship,
take up arms;

The wicked war-god rages everywhere.

58 *Ho epi Kronou bios*. (See, for example, Plato, *Leges*, 713C-D, where the myth is adapted to illustrate the philosopher's social theory.)

59 The story of Cain and his descendants, which is given as an epilogue (Gen. iv. 16-24) to the story of Cain and Abel (Gen. iv. 1-15), represents Cain as the father of civilization in general and all its works. In this epilogue, Cain himself builds a city and his descendant, Lamech, has two sons, Jubal and Tubal-Cain, who are respectively 'the father of all such as handle the harp and organ' and 'an instructor of every artificer in brass and iron'. Here we have the picture of a civilization with an agricultural basis evolving an urban life and industry. At the same time, Jubal and Tubal-Cain are given a brother, Jabal, who is 'the father of such as dwell in tents and such as have cattle', so that Cain's descendant, Lamech, is made progenitor of the Nomadic stock-breeding civilization and the sedentary agricultural and industrial civilizations alike.

60 Hesiod, *Works and Days*, 289.

61 Virgil, *Georgics* I, 121-4.

62 Origen, *Contra Celsum*, iv. 76, xix, cited by A.D. Nock in his edition of Sallustius, *Concerning the Gods and the Universe*, Cambridge, University Press, 1926, p. xlv.

63 Matt. xxv. 24.

64 Hesiod, *Works and Days*, 174-5.

65 Matt. xvi. 13-23; Mark viii. 27-33; Luke ix. 18-22.

66 Matt. xvii. 10-12; Mark xi. 11-14.

67 Matt. xxvi. 36-46; Mark xiv. 32-42; Luke xxii. 39-46. Compare John xii. 23-8.

68 Matt. xxvi. 42.

69 Matt. xxvii. 46; Mark xv. 34.

70 Luke xxviii. 46.

71 John xix. 30.

72 Rom. vii. 24-5. The whole of chapters vii and viii is a lyrical meditation upon this theme.

73 Job xl. 3-5 and xlii. 2-6.

74 *Faust*, II. 4405-612.

75 *Faust*, II. 11384-510.

76 *Faust*, II. 4601-12: *Margaret*. What is this that is rising up from the ground? He! He! Send him off! What does he want in this holy place? He wants me! *Faust*. You must be saved alive! *Margaret*. God's judgment-seat! I have delivered myself into thy hands! *Mephistopheles* (*to Faust*). Quick! Quick! Or I will leave you in the lurch with her. *Margaret*. Our Father, I am thine! Save me! Ye angels! Ye heavenly hosts! Encamp around me, to preserve me! Henry, I shudder at you. *Mephistopheles*. She is condemned! *Voice* (*from above*). Redeemed! *Mephistopheles* (*to Faust*). Away to me (*vanishes with Faust*). *Voice* (*from within, dying away*). Henry! Henry!

This is, psychologically, the end of the play; for Mephistopheles' defeat is irrevocable; and although the light which has broken upon Gretchen's soul in this dawn does not enlighten Faust till many more years have passed over his head, yet his ultimate salvation is ensured by hers, and the labyrinthine second part of the play is therefore psychologically as well as artistically superfluous. By comparison with the last scene of Part I, the corresponding scene in Part II, in which Faust confronts and defies the four grey women - Want and Guilt and Care and Need - is an anti-climax. The last ten lines of Part I already convey the mystery - 'Das ewig Weibliche/Zieht uns hinan' - which is uttered, in the last two lines of Part II, by the Mystic Choir. The poet had no need to point his meaning by an epilogue which almost quadruples the length of his work.

77 Grönbech (see n. 20), Part II, pp. 302-3. Compare Virgil, *Eclogues*, IV.

78 Job xlii. 12-17, compared with i. 2-3.

79 Contrast the fable of Solomon's choice (1 Kgs. iii. 5-15), in which the hero merely forbears to ask for long life or riches for himself, or for the life of his enemies, in order to ask for an understanding heart to judge the people, yet is rewarded by being given, not only a wise and understanding heart, but riches and honour into the bargain.

80 *Faust*, II. 243-70.

81 *Faust*, II. 1583-1606.

82 *Faust*, II. 11866-89.

83 *Faust*, II. 12106-9, quoted in Part I, ch. 10, p. 89, above.

84 Pater Profundus, in *Faust*, II. 11872-3: 'Thus it is the almighty love that fashions and cherishes all that is.'

85 Heb. xii. 6 and Aeschylus, *Agamemnon*, 186-7.

86 Matt. vii. 14.

87 In the Hellenic story of Prometheus, the two services are incompatible, and the hero suffers because he has served Man in God's despite. For an interpretation of Aeschylus's version of the Promethean myth, see Part III, ch. 19, below.

88 Job xlii. 7-10.

89 *Faust*, II. 12069-111.

90 Matt. xvi. 24-8; Mark viii. 34-8; Luke ix. 23-7.

91 John xii. 32.

92 Robert Turgot, 'Plan de Deux Discours sur l'Histoire Universelle', in *Œuvres de Turgot*, nouvelle édition, 2 vols., Paris, Guillaumin, 1844, II, 647. Compare E. Meyer, *Geschichte des Altertums*, 4th edition, Stuttgart and Berlin, Cotta, 1921, I (i), 83 and 174.

93 1 Cor. xv. 57.

14 The arduousness of excellence

1 P.E. Newberry, 'Egypt as a Field for Anthropological Research', in *Report of the ninety-first meeting of the British Association*, London, Murray, 1924, p. 176.

2 Newberry (see n. 1), p. 176.

3 A distinguished geographer, O.H.K. Spate, has in fact made this pertinent objection.

4 S.A. Pakeman, *Ceylon*, London, Benn, 1964, pp. 33-5, quoted by permission of the publisher.

15 The stimulus of hard countries

1 Herodotus VII, 102.

2 Plato, *Critias*, 111A-C.

3 Herodotus IV, 144.

4 See Polybius IV, 45.

5 Num. xxxii.

6 i.e. 'the land of the Philistines'. *Palaistina* is the Greek and *Filastin* the Arabic form of the modern 'Palestine'.

16 The stimulus of penalizations

1 The phrase was coined by J.O'Sullivan in *U.S. Magazine and Democratic Review*, 1845, p. 5.

2 2 Kgs. xviii. 21.

3 *Ra'iyeh* means literally 'the flock' of which the Ottoman padishah was the shepherd. The term was not applied exclusively to his non-Muslim subjects. The Muslim peasantry of Anatolia were called *ra'iyeh* as well as the Christian merchants and ecclesiastics of Constantinople.

4 See Part I, ch. 8, above.

5 This abortive Far Eastern Christian Civilization is discussed further in ch. 17, below.

17 Abortive civilizations

1 See Part IX, ch. 47, below.

2 See Part IX, ch. 47, pp. 418ff., below.

PART III

THE GROWTHS OF CIVILIZATIONS

18 Examples of the arrest of growth

1 See Part I, ch. 10, p. 86, above.

2 See Part V, ch. 27, pp. 222-3, below.

3 For the origins of Nomadism, see E.D. Phillips, *The Royal Hordes*, London, Thames and Hudson, 1965.

4 For this view see R. Pumpelly, *Explorations in Turkestan: Expedition of 1904: Prehistoric Civilizations of Anau*, 2 vols., Washington D.C., Carnegie Institution, 1908.

5 See P.J. Ucko and G.W. Dimbleby (editors), *The Domestication of Plants and Animals*, London, Duckworth, 1967, especially pp. 73-100.

19 The criterion of growth

1 For an analysis of this myth, see Part II, ch. 13, above.

2 Gilbert Murray, *Prometheus Bound translated into English Rhyming Verse*, London, Allen and Unwin, 1931, pp. 8-9.

3 Murray (see n. 2), II. 230-8.

4 Murray (see n. 2), II. 443-4.

5 Murray (see n. 2), II. 241-3.

6 Henri Bergson, *Les Deux Sources de la Morale et de la Religion*, Paris, Alcan, 1932, p. 55.

7 See Part II, ch. 17, and Part III, ch. 18, above.

8 Goethe, *Faust*, II. 3249-50:

From appetite I flounder to enjoyment
And, in enjoyment, crave for appetite.

9 *Mater Gloriosa* (Mary) to *Una Poenitentium* (Gretchen), speaking of *Doctor Marianus* (Faust), in *Faust*, II. 12094-5:

Come, raise thyself to higher spheres!
Lead! He will follow heeding thee.

10 Bergson (see n. 6), pp. 188-9.

11 See Part II, ch. 18, above.

12 See p. 140, below.

13 See Part I, ch. 3, p. 43, above.

14 Bergson (see n. 6), pp. 333 and 73.

15 Bergson (see n. 6), p. 251.

PART IV

THE BREAKDOWNS OF CIVILIZATIONS

20 Is determinism convincing?

1 Lucretius, *De Rerum Natura* II, 1148-52 and 1157-74.

2 Cyprianus, *Ad Demetrianum*, 3. Compare Saint Augustine, *Sermo* lxxxii, 8 (apropos Ps. ciii. 5).

3 i.e. the so-called 'heat death of the Universe'; see Sir James Jeans, *Eos, or the wider Aspects of Cosmogony*, London, Kegan Paul, 1928, pp. 52ff.

4 Compare Pierre Teilhard de Chardin, *The Phenomenon of Man*, London, Collins, 1959, pp. 285-90 and 308-10.

5 P. Moore, *Suns, Myths and Men*, revised edition, London, Muller, 1968, p. 224.

6 O. Spengler, *Der Untergang des Abendlandes*, Vienna and Leipzig, Wilhelm Braunmüller, 1918, I, 152-3.

7 Part I, ch. 3, p. 43, above.

8 Spengler (see n. 6), I, 160-1.

9 'The species boundary between *H.*

erectus and *H. sapiens* is generally and arbitrarily drawn at between 500,000 and 300,000 years ago' (David Pilbeam, *The Evolution of Man*, London, Thames and Hudson, 1970, p. 15). Both species are members of the same genus, but for our present purpose we can take the date of the appearance of the species *H. sapiens* as marking the advent of 'a recognizably human form' of the genus *Homo*.

10 Plato, *Respublica*, 546A-B.

11 Book of Common Prayer, Ps. cvii. 10.

12 For a survey of theories of recurrence see M. Éliade, *Le Mythe de l'Éternel Retour*, Paris, Gallimard, 1949.

13 See G. Cairns, *Philosophies of History*, London, Peter Owen, 1963, pp. 26-31.

14 Éliade (see n. 12), pp. 131-2.

15 Plato, *Leges*, 677A; compare *Critias*, 109D.

16 Plato, *Timaeus*, 21E-23C.

17 Plato, *Politicus*, 269C-273E.

18 Virgil, *Eclogues* IV, 4-7 and 34-6.

19 Marcus Aurelius, *Meditationes* IX, 28; compare V, 13, and VII, 1.

20 R. Thapar, *A History of India*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1966, p. 161.

21 Matt. vi. 7.

22 F. Nietzsche, *Also sprach Zarathustra*, III 13 2; English translation by R. J. Hollingdale, *Thus Spoke Zarathustra*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1961.

23 Aristotle, *Meteorologica* I, 3.

24 Aristotle, *Problemata*, xvii. 3.

25 Virgil, *Georgics* I, 501-2, 505-8, 510-14.

26 Alphonse Karr, *Les Guêpes*, January 1849.

27 See Part II, ch. 13, above.

28 See Part III, ch. 19, p. 136, above.

29 M. Griaule and G. Dieterlen, 'The Dogon' in C. Daryll Forde (editor), *African Worlds*, London, Oxford University Press, 1954, p. 84.

30 Horace, *Carmina* I, 35, 17.

31 Judg. v. 20.

while the passage here quoted from Cyprian contradicts another passage from Cyprian's own pen which occurs in the same tract *Ad Demetrianum*. In this other passage (which has been quoted above in ch. 20, p. 154) Cyprian advocates the view that the Hellenic Society of the age is suffering from an automatic process of senile decay. A judicious admirer of Cyprian will not attempt to explain this manifest contradiction away. He will be content to observe that in chapter 3 of the tract the author is simply reproducing one of the commonplaces of Hellenic philosophy, while in chapter 10 he is expounding a Christian doctrine which has become a living part of Cyprian's own thought.

9 Cyprianus, *Ad Demetrianum*, 10.

10 See Part III, ch. 19, above.

11 Matt. vii. 14.

12 Heb. xii. 1.

13 Matthew Arnold, *Culture and Anarchy*, London, Murray, 1869, pp. 13-14.

14 Henri Bergson, *Les Deux Sources de la Morale et de la Religion*, Paris, Alcan, 1932, p. 251 (quoted in Part III, ch. 19, p. 140, above).

15 Plato's letters, no. 7, 341D.

16 See Part I, ch. 10, p. 85 and n. 1 thereto, above.

17 See Bergson (n. 14), pp. 98-9: 'How is one to get purchase upon the will [of another person]? There are two ways open to the educator. The one way is by drill (*dressage*) . . . the other is by mysticism. . . . The first method inculcates a morality consisting of impersonal habits; the second induces the imitation of another personality, and even a spiritual union, a more or less complete identification with it.' The second method is of course that counselled by Plato.

18 Matt. vii. 13.

19 William Wordsworth, *The Excursion* IX, 188-90.

20 Bergson gives two pertinent examples of the practice of mechanization: the actor who in a public performance re-experiences only formally the emotions which he had made himself experience genuinely when he was learning his part; and the stereotyped 'laws' of magic in a primitive society, which no longer reproduce the natural *élan* which generated the magic; see Bergson (n. 14), pp. 177-8.

21 See Part I, ch. 10, p. 85, above.

22 See Part I, ch. 10, p. 89, above.

23 See Part III, ch. 19, pp. 135-6, above.

24 Matt. xv. 14.

25 See Part III, ch. 18, above.

26 See Part I, ch. 7, p. 56, above.

27 John xxi. 18.

22 The reversal of roles

1 See Aristotle, *Poetica* VI, 18, *et alibi*.

2 Luke iii. 12-13 and vii. 29-30; Matt. xxi. 31-2.

3 Isa. ix. 1; Matt. iv. 15.

4 See Matt. xxi. 31.

5 See Luke iv. 16-32.

6 Luke xviii. 9-14.

7 Luke x. 25-37.

8 Matt. xxi. 42 (quoting Ps. cxviii. 22). Compare Mark xii. 10; Luke xx. 17; Acts iv. 11; Eph. ii. 20; 1 Peter ii. 7.

9 Mark ix. 35 = Matt. xxiii. 11. Compare Mark x. 43-4 = Matt. xx. 26-7.

10 Luke ix. 48.

11 Matt. xviii. 3-5 = Mark ix. 37 = Luke xviii. 16.

12 Matt. xxi. 16, quoting Ps. viii. 2.

13 1 Cor. i. 27-9. The theme is enlarged upon in 1 Cor. ii; and in 1 Cor. iii. 18-21 the *peripeteia* between 'wisdom' and 'foolishness', which is the first of the four antitheses in i. 27-8, is taken up again and carried further. Compare Col. ii. 8.

14 Herodotus VII, 10.

15 Compare the latter-day British boast of possessing an empire 'on which the sun never sets'.

16 Herodotus I, *passim*; III, *passim*.

17 Horace, *Carmina* I, 3, 37-40.

18 Lucretius, *De Rerum Natura* V, 1222-5.

19 The *Tao-te Ching*, ch. 9; translated by Arthur Waley, *The Way and its Power*, London, Allen and Unwin, 1934.

20 Isa. ii. 12-17. Compare Obad. 3-4 (echoing Jer. xlix. 16).

21 Ecc. ix. 11-12.

22 The *Magnificat*, in Luke i. 51-2.

23 Gilbert Murray, *Prometheus Bound translated into English Rhyming Verse*, London, Allen and Unwin, 1931.

24 Eph. iv. 18.

25 See Part III, ch. 18, above.

26 For the role of the Serpent see Part II, ch. 13, above.

27 1 Cor. x. 12.

28 Prov. xvi. 18.

29 Plato, *Leges*, 691C.

30 See the list in Part I, ch. 9, p. 72, above.

31 John iii. 4.

32 Matt. xviii. 3.

23 Athens and Venice: the idolization of an ephemeral institution

1 See Part I, ch. 1, pp. 34-7, above, for the nature of idolatry as exemplified in the modern Western political aberration of nationalism.

2 Goethe, *Faust*, I, 249, quoted in Part II, ch. 13, p. 100, above.

3 Mark xiii. 14 = Matt. xxiv. 15. Compare Luke xxi. 20. These passages in the New Testament are reminiscences of Dan. ix. 27 and xii. 11.

4 In Part III, ch. 19, pp. 138-9, above.

5 The phrase, as we have it, occurs in the rendering of Pericles's funeral oration by Thucydides in II, 41.

6 Job xlii. 6.

7 See Plato, *Leges* IV, 704D-705B. This passage reads like a deliberate rejoinder to part of Pericles's funeral oration, recorded by Thucydides in II, 38 (2); similarly *Leges* IV, 707A-C is Plato's reply to Thucydides II, 39 (3) and 40 (2).

21 The mechanicalness of mimesis

1 See Part III, ch. 19, p. 140, above.

2 George Meredith, *Modern Love*, stanza 43.

3 C. F. Volney, 'Les Ruines' in *Oeuvres Complètes*, Paris, Didot, 1860, pp. 12-13.

4 Menander, fragment 540.

5 Ambrose, *Hexameron* I, vii, 31, quoted in P. Brown, *Augustine of Hippo*, London, Faber and Faber, 1967, p. 85.

6 Basil Davidson, *The Africans*, London, Longmans, 1969, p. 147; and see also chs. 12-15.

7 For an examination of this doctrine see Part IV, ch. 20, pp. 154-5, above. For Volney's analysis, see his 'Leçons d'Histoire' in *Oeuvres Complètes* (n. 3).

8 The two analyses are analogous inasmuch as they both fly in the face of the prevailing philosophy of the day. Volney's intuition, as we have observed, gives the lie to the fundamental doctrine of eighteenth-century Western philosophy,

8 Plutarch, *Life of Sulla*, XIV, 5.

9 For the differences in ethos, and consequent divergence in action, between the Achaeans and Arcadians on one side, and the rest of the Ten Thousand on the other, see Xenophon, *Cyri Anabasis*, *passim*, especially VI, 1-3.

10 Polybius XVIII, 14.

11 See the account in Acts xvii. 16-34.

12 The superiority of Italian over Transalpine culture, which was so striking towards the end of the fifteenth century, is sometimes placed to the credit of the foregoing renaissance in Italy of Latin and Greek letters (the authentic renaissance of a defunct Hellenic culture in Italy must be distinguished from the Transalpine mimesis of this wholly Italian achievement). But the Italian renaissance was not the cause, but rather partly the instrument or medium, and partly an incidental consequence, of the special local advance in civilization which Italy made in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. The true cause of the advance was not an Italian mimesis of Hellenic culture, but a series of creative Italian responses to contemporary challenges. For the phenomenon of renaissances in general, and the Italian example in particular, see Part X, below.

24 The East Roman Empire: the idolization of an ephemeral institution

1 i.e. the Nestorian and Monophysite reaction in Mesopotamia, Syria, and Egypt against the official Catholic Christianity of the Empire.

2 See ch. 26, p. 199, below.

3 The assertion is attributed to Leo in these terms by Pope Gregory II in a letter (Ep. xiii) replying to a no longer extant letter of Leo's. See A. A. Vasiliev, *Histoire de l'Empire Byzantin*, 2 vols., Paris, Picard, 1932, I, 341.

4 The Western universities largely owed their stimulus and their liberty to the fact that they were under the aegis and auspices of the Papacy, instead of being under the thumb of the local temporal lord or the local bishop. For the attitude of the Papacy to the emergent Italian city-states in the twelfth century, see ch. 26, p. 201, below.

5 The essence of the 'Adoptionist' as opposed to the 'Conceptionist' faith is a belief that Jesus was not born divine, but that in virtue of his human spiritual achievements and merits he was designated by God as the son of God when, at the moment of his baptism, he was taken possession of by the Holy Spirit as a human vehicle for its divine activity. In the Paulician sect's Armenian homeland the Paulicians' original 'Adoptionist' doctrine survived till the nineteenth century. On the other hand, on East Roman soil Paulicianism appears to have been transformed, in the early ninth century, from

an 'Adoptionist' form of Christianity into a 'dualistic' religion in which the power of evil was credited with at least a partial independence of the power of good. See N. Garsoïan, *The Paulician Heresy*, Paris and The Hague, Mouton, 1947.

6 See ch. 26, p. 206, below.

7 On p. 180, above.

8 See Part III, ch. 19, p. 137, above.

9 Russia, which had been converted to Orthodox Christianity in 985, had tacitly acquiesced in its implicit subjection to the imperial government's nominal sovereignty.

10 Matt. xii. 25 = Mark iii. 24 = Luke xi. 17.

25 David and Goliath: the idolization of an ephemeral technique

1 See the story as it is told in 1 Sam. xvii.

2 Polybius XXIX, 17.

3 See the description of the battle in Ammianus Marcellinus, *Res Gestae* XXXI, 11-13.

4 See the eyewitness account by Falak-ad-Din Muhammad b. Aydimir, quoted by Ibn-al-Tiqtaqa in *Kitab-al-Fakhri*; English translation by E. G. Browne, *A Literary History of Persia*, London, Fisher, Unwin, 1906, II, 462.

5 See the contemporary account in Jean, Sire de Joinville, *La Vie du Saint Roi Louis mise en nouveau langage par Henri Lognon*, Paris, A l'enseigne de la Cité des Livres, pp. 87-8. English translation by M. R. B. Shaw, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1963.

6 'Personne n'a su ni rien oublier, ni rien apprendre.' Chevalier de Panat in a letter dated London, January 1796, in *Mémoires et Correspondance de Mallet du Pan*, 2 vols., Paris, Amyot et Cherbuliez, II, ch. 9, p. 197.

7 See the eyewitness account in Shaykh 'Abd-ar-Rahman al-Jabarti, *Aja'ib-al-Athar fi'l-Tarajim wa'l-Akhhbar*, 4 vols., Cairo, A.H., 1322, III, *ad init.*; French translation in *Merveilles Biographiques et Historiques*, 9 vols., Cairo, Imprimerie Nationale, 1888-96; Paris, Leroux, 1888-96, VI *ad init.*

26 The Roman See: the intoxication of victory

1 See ch. 24, above.

2 On this point see ch. 24, pp. 189-90, above.

3 The subjugation of Ireland by the English Crown was sanctioned in advance by an incumbent of the Papal office who was perhaps unable to forget that, before he became Pope Hadrian IV, he had been the Englishman Nicholas Breakspear; but this case seems to have been exceptional. Indeed, it is the only notable

instance in which the medieval Papacy lent its authority to promote the conquest of a small and weak community within the bosom of Western Christendom by a large and strong one. The part played by the Papacy in helping Hungary and Poland to escape the heavy yoke of the Holy Roman Empire, and the city-states of Lombardy to throw it off, is more characteristic of the Papal policy towards the political system of medieval Western Christendom.

4 See ch. 24, pp. 183-5, above.

5 2 Sam. xii. 14.

6 Edward Gibbon, *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, ch. lx.

7 Gibbon (see n. 6), ch. lx.

8 Dan. v. 25-28.

9 Ps. vii. 15.

PART V

THE DISINTEGRATIONS OF CIVILIZATIONS

27 The nature and symptoms of social disintegration

1 See Part I, ch. 7, p. 59, above.

2 See Part III, ch. 18, above.

3 See Part III, ch. 19, p. 136, above.

4 See Part III, ch. 19, pp. 136-7, above.

5 Herodotus I, 32.

6 See Part IV, ch. 21, p. 166, above.

7 In Part I, ch. 7, above.

8 An example of this unity in diversity is the social relation between knights and villeins which was the ideal - though not always the practice - of the medieval Western feudal system.

9 See Part I, ch. 7, p. 56, above.

10 See Part IV, ch. 21, p. 166, above.

11 See Part III, ch. 19, pp. 137-8, above.

12 See Part I, ch. 7, pp. 56-7, above.

13 See A. Bazard, 'Exposition de la Doctrine Saint-Simonienne' in *Oeuvres de Saint-Simon et d'Enfantin*, Paris, Leroux, 1877, XLI, 171-4.

14 A. MacIntyre, *Marxism and Christianity*, London, Duckworth, 1969, p. 2.

15 MacIntyre (see n. 14), p. 112.

16 See Part I, ch. 7, pp. 56-7, above.

17 The literal meaning of 'palingenesia' is 'a recurrence of birth', which has an ambiguous connotation: while it may mean a repetitive rebirth of something that has been born before, it is used here in its other meaning of an unprecedented new birth of something that is now being born for the first time.

28 Internal proletariats

1 Thucydides III, 82.

2 Compare Matt. x. 21, and 34-7 = Luke xii. 51-3, xiv. 25-7, and xxi. 16-17 (quoting Mic. vii. 6); Matt. xii. 46-50 =

- Mark iii. 31–5 = Luke viii. 19–21 – A.J.T.
 3 Thucydides III, 82–3.
 4 In Part I, ch. 7, p. 56, above.
 5 The phrase may be coined on the pertinent analogy of the ‘poor whites’ of the Southern States of the USA or of South Africa today.
 6 ‘As the news [of the outbreak of the first Sicilian slave-war] spread, slave-revolts flared up everywhere. At Rome a hundred and fifty persons entered into a conspiracy, in Attica over a thousand, and others in Delos and elsewhere’ (Diodorus of Agyrium, *A Library of Universal History* XXXIV–XXXV, 2, §19 (fragments)). Delos, which was the principal slave-market of the Hellenic World in the second century BC, was on the threshold of the Attalid kingdom in western Asia Minor, which was the theatre of Aristonicus’s tragic adventure.
 7 Diodorus of Agyrium (see n. 6), 2, §§39 and 13. Diodorus says of the slaves’ treatment of Damophilus’s daughter: ‘This was a demonstration that the treatment meted out to the others was not the expression of any innate barbarity in the slaves, but was simply retribution for the wrongs which had previously been inflicted upon them.’
 8 2 Macc. vi–viii., in contrast with the remainder of the book.
 9 Luke xxii. 36.
 10 Luke xxii. 38.
 11 Luke xxii. 49–51.
 12 Acts v. 35–9.
 13 Matt. xvi. 21–6.
 14 Matt. xxvi. 56.
 15 Matt. xxiv. 15–28 = Mark xiii. 14–23 = Luke xxi. 20–4.
 16 In Parts VI and VII, below.

29 External proletariats

- 1 This phenomenon will be examined in Part IX, below.
 2 Rome is so described in a surviving fragment of a lost work by Plato’s pupil Heraclides Ponticus; see Plutarch, *Camil-lus*, 22.
 3 Saint Augustine, *De Civitate Dei* I, 7.
 4 Saint Augustine (see n. 3) V, 23.

30 Schism in the soul

- 1 See Part III, ch. 19, and Part IV, ch. 21, above.
 2 Marcus Aurelius, *Meditationes* IV, 1.
 3 Marcus Aurelius (see n. 2) IV, 49.
 4 Marcus Aurelius (see n. 2) IV, 48.
 5 Epictetus, *Dissertationes* I, 16, §§15–16 and 19–21.
 6 Epictetus (see n. 5) III, 5, §§7–11.
 7 See Part IV, ch. 23, p. 171, above.
 8 See ch. 31, p. 253, below.
 9 See Part IV, ch. 20, above.
 10 See Henri Bergson, *L’Évolution Créatrice*, 24th edition, Paris, Alcan, 1921, pp. 239–58.

- 11 ‘The Admonitions of a Prophet’ in A. Erman, *The Literature of the Ancient Egyptians*, English translation by Aylward M. Blackman, London, Methuen, 1927, p. 95.
 12 Plato, *Politicus*, 272D6–273E4.
 13 C.N. Cochrane, *Christianity and Classical Culture*, Oxford, University Press, 1940, pp. 478–9.
 14 *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, London, Luzac, 1927, II, s.v. Kadar.
 15 See Part III, ch. 19, pp. 137–8, above.
 16 See Part III, ch. 18, above.
 17 Aeschylus, *Agamemnon*, 186–7; first quoted in Part II, ch. 13, p. 109, above.
 18 See Part IV, ch. 21, pp. 160–1, above.

31 The challenge of disintegration

- 1 In Part III, ch. 19, pp. 137–8, above.
 2 Epictetus, *Dissertationes* I, 4, §3, and IV, 4, §39.
 3 *Upadana-sutta* II, 84, quoted in E.J. Thomas, *The History of Buddhist Thought*, London, Kegan Paul, 1933, p. 62.
 4 *Udana*, ch. VIII, quoted in T.C. Humphreys, *Buddhism*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1952, p. 127.
 5 *Sutta Nipata*, quoted in E. Conze, *Buddhist Scriptures*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1959, p. 79.
 6 Seneca, *De Clementia* II, 6 and 5.
 7 Robert Browning, ‘One Word More’, xiv.
 8 Luke xvii. 20–1.
 9 William Blake, ‘Auguries of Innocence’.
 10 Seng-ts’an, *Sin sin ming*, quoted in Conze (see n. 5), pp. 174–5.
 11 Saraha, *Dohakosha*, quoted in Conze (see n. 5), p. 179.
 12 In Part IV, ch. 23, p. 171, above.
 13 John iii. 16–17.
 14 John iii. 3–8.
 15 1 John iv. 11–12.
 16 Thomas à Kempis, *The Imitation of Christ* II, 12; English translation by Leo Sherley-Price, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1952, pp. 87–8.
 17 See Part V, ch. 27, p. 228, above.
 18 John x. 10.

PART VI

UNIVERSAL STATES

32 Universal states: ends or means?

- 1 See Part I, chs. 2 and 5, above.
 2 See Part I, ch. 2, p. 42, above.
 3 See Part V, ch. 27, p. 224, above.
 4 In Part V, ch. 31, p. 250, above.
 5 See below, pp. 271–2.
 6 Tibullus, *Carmina* II, 5, 23–4.
 7 Virgil, *Aeneid* I, 278–9.

- 8 Velleius Paterculus II, 103.
 9 Livy IV, 4, §4.
 10 Livy XXVIII, 28, §11.
 11 Suetonius, *Nero*, 11, §2.
 12 G. Henzen (editor), *Acta Fratrum Arvalium Quae Supersunt*, Berlin, Reimer, 1874, p. lxxxii.
 13 Henzen (see n. 12), pp. cxv, cxix, cxxvi.
 14 P. Aelius Aristides, *In Romam* XXVI, §109.
 15 C. Rutilius Namatianus, *De Reditu Suo* I, 115–16, 123–34, 137–46.
 16 Saint Jerome, *Epistola* XXVII, 12, written in AD 412, in J.-P. Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, Paris, 1844–64, XXII, col. 1094.
 17 Dispatch from the Court of Directors, quoted in T.G.P. Spear, *Twilight of the Mughals*, Cambridge, University Press, 1951, p. 44.
 18 See Part IV, ch. 24, p. 192, above.
 19 For Mehmet II’s acceptance of this doctrine, see H. Inalcik, ‘The Policy of Mehmet II towards the Greek Population of Istanbul and the Byzantine Buildings of the City’ in *Dumbarton Oaks Papers*, nos. 23 and 24, 1969–70, pp. 229–49, on p. 233.
 20 In Part IV, ch. 24, above.
 21 In Part II, ch. 16, pp. 119–20, above.
 22 See Steven Runciman, *The Great Church in Captivity*, Cambridge, University Press, 1966, pp. 110 and 321.
 23 See D. Obolensky, *The Byzantine Commonwealth and Eastern Europe 500–1493*, London, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1971, p. 363.
 24 Runciman (see n. 22), p. 228.
 25 The Georgian Church had been represented at Florence in 1439, and it may have compromised itself on this occasion. In any case, the Georgian principalities came under Ottoman and Safavi suzerainty in the sixteenth century, leaving Muscovy as the sole surviving independent Orthodox Christian state.
 26 Runciman (see n. 22), pp. 329–30.
 27 Runciman (see n. 22), p. 323; Obolensky (see n. 23), p. 363.
 28 Philotheus of Pskov, as cited by N. Zernov, *The Russians and their Church*, London, Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge, 1945, p. 50. See also the citation in Obolensky (n. 23), p. 363.
 29 Text as cited in Zernov (see n. 28), p. 71.
 30 Obolensky (see n. 23), p. 366.
 31 Obolensky (see n. 23), p. 366.
 32 Obolensky (see n. 23), p. 365.
 33 Inscription, probable date 9 BC; text as in W. Dittenberger, *Orientalis Graeci Inscriptiones Selectae*, Leipzig, Hirzel, 1905, II, 48–60.
 34 C.N. Cochrane, *Christianity and Classical Culture*, Oxford, University Press, 1940, p. 130.
 35 Aelius Aristides (see n. 14) XXVI, §§68–70.
 36 See Part V, ch. 31, pp. 249–50, above.
 37 E. Meyer, *Geschichte des Altertums*, Stuttgart, Cotta, 1901, III, 24–5.
 38 Aelius Aristides (see n. 14) XXVI, §§79–84.

- 39 Appian of Alexandria, *Studies in Roman History*, Preface.
- 40 Lucretius, *De Rerum Natura* V, 361-3.
- 41 Lucretius (see n. 40) II, 303-7.
- 42 Menander, fragment 540; quoted in Part IV, ch. 21, p. 160, above.
- 43 George Meredith, *Modern Love*, stanza 43; quoted in Part IV, ch. 21, p. 161, above.
- 44 Lucretius (see n. 40) III, 964-5 and 967-71.

33 The boons of conductivity and peace

- 1 O. Spengler, *Der Untergang des Abendlandes*, Vienna and Leipzig, Wilhelm Braunnüller, 1918, I, 51. The pith of the point that Spengler is making is concentrated in Francis Bacon's dictum that 'it was not the Romans that spread upon the World; But it was the World that spread upon the Romans' (in *The Essays, or Counsels Civil and Moral* XXIX, 'Of the True Greatness of Kingdoms and Estates').
- 2 P. Aelius Aristides, *In Romam*, §62.
- 3 C. Plinius Secundus, *Historia Naturalis* XXVII, i, §63.
- 4 R. Storry, *A History of Modern Japan*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1960, pp. 66-7, 73-5.
- 5 Plato, *Leges*, 693A.
- 6 Aelius Aristides (see n. 2), §102.
- 7 C. Rutilius Namatianus, *De Reditu Suo* I, §66.
- 8 Plinius Secundus (see n. 3) III, v, §39.
- 9 The phrase used by Herodotus (I, 66) to describe the progress of Sparta under the impetus that she received from the institution of the Lysurgian agoge.
- 10 Pope Leo the Great, *Sermo* LXXXII, ch. 2, in J.-P. Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, Paris, 1844-64, LIV, col. 423.
- 11 In Part V, ch. 27, p. 228, above.
- 12 In Part VIII, ch. 43, below.

34 Communications

- 1 E. Meyer, *Geschichte des Altertums*, Stuttgart, Cotta, 1901, III, 66-8.
- 2 E. A. Belyaev, *Arabs, Islam and the Arab Caliphate*, London, Pall Mall, 1969, pp. 224-5.
- 3 Garcilaso de la Vega, *Royal Commentaries of the Incas and General History of Peru*, translated by H. J. Livermore, Austin and London, University of Texas Press, 1966, Part I, pp. 48-52.
- 4 Garcilaso de la Vega (see n. 3), p. 328.
- 5 The nickname given to the ruling minority in the Inca Empire by their Spanish conquerors - A. J. T.
- 6 L. Baudin, *L'Empire Socialiste des Incas*, Paris, Institut d'Ethnologie, 1928, pp. 120-1.
- 7 Ch'ao-ting Chi, *Key Economic Areas in Chinese History as Revealed in the Develop-*

- ment of Public Works for Water-Control*, London, Allen and Unwin, 1936, pp. 4-5.
- 8 Ch'ao-ting Chi (see n. 7), p. 113.
- 9 Ch'ao-ting Chi (see n. 7), pp. 113-14.
- 10 Epictetus, *Dissertationes* III, 13, §9.
- 11 P. Aelius Aristides, *In Romam* §§100-101.
- 12 Irenaeus, *Contra Haereses* II, x, 2, in J.-P. Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, Paris, 1857-66, VII, cols. 552-3.
- 13 Ammianus Marcellinus, *Res Gestae* XXI, xvi, §18.
- 14 M. J. de Goeje (editor), *Bibliotheca Geographorum Arabicorum*, Leiden, 1870 seqq.
- 15 C. P. Fitzgerald, *China, A Short Cultural History*, London, Cresset Press, 1935, p. 138.
- 16 J. Romein in M. F. A. Montagu (editor), *Toynbee and History*, Boston, Porter Sargent, 1956, p. 350, quoted in Part I, ch. 4, n. 3, p. 541, above.
- 17 On these points see further Part VII, chs. 40 and 41, below.

35 Languages and scripts

- 1 The non-Muslim autonomous communities were known by the name of *millet* - a word of Arabic origin with a meaning betwixt and between the connotations of the Western words 'nation' and 'church'. Though the dominant Muslim community was not called a *millet*, its constitution and status were in essence the same as those of the Jewish *millet* and of the several Christian *millets* of different denominations.
- 2 For example, in 180 B.C. the municipality of Cumae, whose citizens had possessed the passive rights of Roman citizenship (the Roman *civitas sine suffragio*) since 338 B.C., was allowed, in response to a petition from the municipal authorities themselves, to substitute Latin for the community's native Oscan as its official language. (See Livy XI, 43.)

36 Capital cities

- 1 See ch. 34, p. 291, above.
- 2 Garcilaso de la Vega, *Royal Commentaries of the Incas and General History of Peru*, translated by H. J. Livermore, Austin and London, University of Texas Press, 1966, Part I, pp. 421-2.
- 3 See Cicero, *Ad Atticum* II, i, §8.

37 Civil services

- 1 See ch. 34, p. 288, above.
- 2 See ch. 33, p. 278, above.
- 3 C. P. Fitzgerald, *China, A Short Cultural History*, London, Cresset Press, 1935, pp. 153-5.

- 4 See D. Coombes, *Towards a European Civil Service*, London, Chatam House and Political and Economic Planning, 1968, p. 39.
- 5 See ch. 35, p. 297, above.

38 Have universal states a future?

- 1 See ch. 32, pp. 271-3, above.
- 2 See ch. 36, above.
- 3 In ch. 34, pp. 294-5, above.

PART VII

UNIVERSAL CHURCHES

39 Cancers or chrysalises?

- 1 In Part V, ch. 27, p. 228, and Part VI, *passim*, above.
- 2 C. Rutilius Namatianus, *De Reditu Suo* I, 439-42, 445-6.
- 3 Rutilius Namatianus (see n. 2) I, 515-26.
- 4 Edward Gibbon, *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, ch. lxxi.
- 5 For example: 'The Graeco-Roman world has descended into the great hollow which is roughly called the Middle Ages, extending from the fifth to the fifteenth century, a hollow in which many great, beautiful, and heroic things were done and created, but in which knowledge, as we understand it, had no place. The revival of learning and the Renaissance are memorable as the first sturdy breasting of Humanity of the hither slope of the great hollow which lies between us and the Ancient World. The modern man, reformed and regenerated by knowledge, looks across it and recognizes on the opposite ridge, in the far-shining cities and stately porticoes, in the art, politics and science of Antiquity, many more ties of kinship and sympathy than in the mighty concave between, wherein dwell his Christian ancestry, in the dim light of scholasticism and theology.' J. C. Morison, *The Service of Man: an Essay towards the Religion of the Future*, London, Kegan Paul, Trench, 1887, pp. 177-8.
- 6 See for example, S. Mazzarino, *The End of the Ancient World*, London, Faber and Faber, 1966, for a discussion of historical approaches to the fall of the Roman Empire.
- 7 J. P. V. D. Baldson, *Rome: The Story of an Empire*, London, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1970, p. 246.
- 8 C. N. Cochrane, *Christianity and Classical Culture*, Oxford, University Press, 1940, pp. 510-11.
- 9 Cochrane (see n. 8), p. 501.
- 10 Matt. xxii. 37-40.
- 11 1 John iv. 20.
- 12 1 Kgs. iii. 5-15.
- 13 Matt. x. 39 and xvi. 25; Mark viii. 35;

- Luke ix. 24 and xvii. 33; John xii. 25.
 14 Robert Browning, 'Andrea del Sarto', ll. 97-8.
 15 H. Chadwick, *The Early Church*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1967, p. 178.
 16 Chadwick (see n. 15), p. 178.
 17 T. C. Humphreys, *Buddhism*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1951, pp. 132-3, quoting A. K. Coomaraswamy, *Buddha and the Gospel of Buddhism*, London, Harrap, 1916, p. 120.
 18 Humphreys (see n. 17), p. 160.
 19 R. C. Zaehner, *Concordant Discord: The Interdependence of Faiths*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1970, p. 134.

- A Rumour of Angels*, London, Allen Lane, 1970.
 10 John Milton, *Paradise Lost* IV, l. 110.
 11 In *De Rerum Natura* V, 195-227.
 12 See Part V, ch. 31, pp. 251-3, above.
 13 Job v. 7.
 14 See Part V, ch. 28, pp. 232-3, above.
 15 Heb. xii. 6.

PART VIII HEROIC AGES

42 The barbarian past

40 Societies of a distinctive species?

- 1 See Part V, ch. 27, above.
 2 See Part I, ch. 6, p. 52, above.
 3 See Part IX, ch. 47, below.
 4 See Part VI, ch. 34, pp. 294-5, above.
 5 Matt. x. 5-6; xv. 21-8.
 6 Mark vii. 24-30.
 7 See Part VIII, ch. 42, below.
 8 'Allah' means 'the god', i.e. the unique god of Judaism and Christianity, in the Syriac language as well as in Arabic. In Syriac translations of the Greek texts of the Bible and the Christian Fathers, the Christian Greek term 'Ho Theos' is translated as 'Allah'.
 9 For the transformation of the Arab successor-state of the Roman and Sasanian Empires into an Islamic universal state in which all Muslims had the status of first-class citizens regardless of their nationality, see M. A. Shaban, *The 'Abbasid Revolution*, Cambridge, University Press, 1970, and *Islamic History AD 600-750: A New Interpretation*, Cambridge, University Press, 1971.
 10 See Part V, ch. 31, pp. 251-2, above.
 11 See ch. 39, pp. 327-30, above.
 12 Luke xiv. 23.

- 1 See Part V, ch. 29, p. 234, above.
 2 See Part IX, chs. 48 and 49, below.
 3 An illuminating and entertaining analysis of this three-cornered economic relationship can be found in E. A. Thompson, *A History of Attila and the Huns*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1948, pp. 184-97.
 4 Owen Lattimore, *Inner Asian Frontiers of China*, London and New York, Oxford University Press, 1940, pp. 240 and 242.
 5 Lattimore (see n. 4), p. 243.
 6 Lattimore (see n. 4), p. 239.
 7 Lattimore (see n. 4), pp. 243-4.
 8 Priscus of Panium, *History of His Own Times*, in L. Dindorf (editor), *Historici Graeci Minores*, Berlin and Leipzig, Teubner, 1870, I, 305-9.
 9 Thompson (see n. 3), p. 175, quoting Zachariah of Mytilene.
 10 Thompson (see n. 3), pp. 173 and 172.
 11 See Part VI, ch. 33, p. 278, above.
 12 J. P. V. D. Balsdon, *Rome: The Story of an Empire*, London, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1970, p. 225; the observation was made by Caccilius Firmianus Lactantius.
 13 Tacitus, *Germania*, 5.
 14 Tacitus (see n. 13), 45.
 15 The maxim is in an essay by Kia Yi, the general tenor of which is reproduced by O. Franke in *Geschichte des Chinesischen Reiches*, Berlin, de Gruyter, 1930, I, 132-3.
 16 Zosimus, *Historiae* IV, xxxi, §§ 1-3.
 17 On p. 364, above.
 18 The play of this motif in human affairs - for which Aristotle coined the term *peripeteia* - has been discussed in Part IV, ch. 22, above.
 19 V. Grönbech, *The Culture of the Teutons*, London, Oxford University Press, 1931, Part II, p. 305.
 20 George Meredith, *Modern Love*, first quoted in Part IV, ch. 21, p. 161, above.
 21 Gilbert Murray, *The Rise of the Greek Epic*, 3rd edition, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1924, p. 84.
 22 Murray (see n. 21), pp. 85-7.
 23 Père H. Lammens, S.J., 'Études sur le règne du Calife Omayyade Mo'awia Ier' in *Mélanges de la Faculté Orientale* II, Paris, London and Leipzig, 1908, p. 67.
 24 Lammens (see n. 23), p. 68.
 25 Lammens (see n. 23), pp. 72 and 79.

43 The image and the reality

- 1 Procopius, *A History of the Wars of Justinian* IV, 9.
 2 Homer, *Odyssey* I, 46-7.
 3 Hesiod, *Works and Days*, 143-55.
 4 Hesiod (see n. 3), 156-73.
 5 Hesiod (see n. 3), 122-6.
 6 Hesiod (see n. 3), 141-2.
 7 H. M. Chadwick, *The Heroic Age*, Cambridge, University Press, 1912, pp. 31-2.
 8 Chadwick (see n. 7), p. 39.
 9 Aristotle, *Poetica* XXIV, 18.
 10 William Wordsworth, 'Elegiac Stanzas suggested by a Picture of Peele Castle in a Storm'.

PART IX

CONTACTS BETWEEN CIVILIZATIONS IN SPACE

44 Encounters between contemporary civilizations

- 1 See Part VI, ch. 32, p. 266, and Part VII, ch. 40, p. 336, above.
 2 See Part IV, above.
 3 See Part III, ch. 15, p. 118, above.
 4 See Part X, below.
 5 See list in Part I, ch. 9, p. 72, above.

45 The modern West and Russia

- 1 See ch. 44, p. 398, above.
 2 See Part VI, ch. 32, p. 272, above.
 3 For an explanation of this term, see ch. 49, pp. 436-7, below.
 4 See Part VI, ch. 32, p. 272, above.
 5 For an explanation of this term, see ch. 49, pp. 436-7, below.
 6 See Part VI, ch. 37, p. 311, above.
 7 L. Trotsky, *The History of the Russian Revolution*, London, Gollancz, 1965, p. 24.
 8 See Part V, ch. 27, p. 225, and Part VII, ch. 41, above.

46 The modern West and Eastern Asia

- 1 The distinction between the Japanese and the Chinese interest is explored in C. M. Cipolla, *European Culture and Overseas Expansion*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1970, pp. 95-6 and 167-70.
 2 A Japanese colony established itself at Manila between 1593 and 1614 (see C. R. Boxer, *The Christian Century in Japan, 1549-1650*, London, Cambridge University Press, 1951, p. 302), and during the first quarter of the seventeenth century similar colonies of Japanese traders and mercenaries made their appearance at various points in South-East Asia (see Boxer, pp. 296-7).

41 Social responses to an illusion or to a reality?

- 1 M. Éliade, *Myths, Dreams and Mysteries*, London, Harvill Press, 1960, pp. 17-18.
 2 See Part I, ch. 5, pp. 48-52, above.
 3 Aeschylus, *Agamemnon*, 186-7, quoted in Part II, ch. 13, p. 109, above.
 4 Lucretius, *De Rerum Natura* I, 101: 'So vast is the sum of the iniquities that religion has induced [people to perpetrate].'
 5 Bertrand Russell, 'Has Religion made Useful Contributions to Civilization?' in *Why I am not a Christian*, London, Allen and Unwin, 1957, p. 18.
 6 R. C. Zaehner, *Concordant Discord*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1970, p. 22.
 7 In ch. 40, p. 341, above.
 8 See Part IV, ch. 20, p. 155, above.
 9 The phrase is Peter Berger's; see

3 There were Japanese traders in Mexico in 1597 (see J. Murdoch, *History of Japan*, Kobe, Kobe Chronicle, 1903, II, 292). Japanese traders were doing business all over the Pacific by the time at which they were suddenly prohibited from engaging in foreign trade by the non-intercourse ordinance of 1636 (see Murdoch, p. 692).
4 See Part VI, ch. 37, p. 308, above.
5 See ch. 49, pp. 443-4, below.

47 Encounters with the post-Alexandrine Hellenic Society

1 See W.F. Albright, *From the Stone Age to Christianity*, 2nd edition, Baltimore, Johns Hopkins University Press, 1957, pp. 337-8.
2 Albright (see n. 1), p. 338.
3 Albright (see n. 1), p. 338.
4 In Part VI, ch. 38, above.
5 The phrase is J. Romein's, first quoted in Part I, ch. 4, n. 3, p. 541, above.

48 The social consequences of encounters between contemporary civilizations

1 See Part IV, ch. 21, p. 166, above.
2 Lucy Mair, *Primitive Government*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1962, pp. 254-5.
3 Mair (see n. 2), p. 255.
4 J. Maquet, *Power and Society in Africa*, London, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1971, pp. 122-3.
5 Maquet (see n. 4), p. 118.
6 See ch. 45, pp. 401-3, above.
7 See ch. 49, pp. 436-42, below.
8 Isaac Deutscher, *Russia, China, and the West*, edited by F. Halliday, Oxford, University Press, 1970, pp. 333 and 334.
9 See ch. 49, pp. 437-42, below.
10 John Bowring, *Report on Egypt and Candia* dated 27 March 1839, and addressed to the Right Hon. Lord Viscount Palmerston, London, Clowes and Clowes, 1849, p. 49.
11 For these developments see P. J. Vatikotis, *The Modern History of Egypt*, London, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1969, especially pp. 49-125.
12 Quoted in E. S. Mason, 'The Planning of Development' in *Scientific American*, September 1963, p. 235.
13 M. Barratt Brown, *After Imperialism*, London, Heinemann, 1963, p. 407.

49 The psychological consequences of encounters between contemporary civilizations

1 Luke xviii. 11.
2 In Part II, ch. 11, p. 91, above.
3 See the Qur'an, Surah xxii. 17.
4 See Norman Cohn, *The Pursuit of the*

Millennium, revised and expanded edition, London, Temple Smith, 1970, p. 80.
5 2 Macc. iv. 7-17.
6 1 Sam. viii. 5 and 20.
7 See Part V, ch. 28, p. 231, above.
8 See Part II, ch. 16, pp. 119-20, above.
9 See Part IV, ch. 21, p. 166, and Part IX, ch. 48, pp. 423-4, above.
10 See Part V, ch. 30, pp. 245-6, above.
11 In Part VI, ch. 38, above.
12 See Part V, ch. 28, p. 232-3, above.
13 See Part IV, ch. 23, p. 171, above.

PART X

CONTACTS BETWEEN CIVILIZATIONS IN TIME

50 Renaissances of institutions, laws and philosophies

1 In Part IX, ch. 44, p. 396, above.
2 Christopher Dawson, *Religion and the Rise of Western Culture*, London, Sheed and Ward, 1950, pp. 15 and 89.
3 Dawson (see n. 2), p. 89.
4 In Part IV, ch. 24, above.
5 J. B. Bury, in his edition of Edward Gibbon, *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, London, Methuen, 1898, V, Appendix 11, p. 525.
6 See C. E. Zachariae von Lingenthal, *Collectio Librorum Juris Graeco-Romani Ineditorum: Ecloga Leonis et Constantini; Epanagoge Basilii, Leonis, et Alexandri*, Leipzig, Barth, 1852.
7 Matt. v. 29-30; Matt. xviii. 8-9; Mark ix. 43-7.
8 i.e. by the Emperors of the Syrian dynasty - A. J. T.

52 Renaissances of religion

1 See Part IX, ch. 47, p. 419, above.
2 Eph. vi. 13-14.
3 Exod. xx. 3-5.
4 Mark ii. 27.
5 e.g. Matt. xii. 1-13; Mark ii. 23-8 and iii. 1-6; Luke xiii. 11-17; John v. 1-18.
6 See Part IX, ch. 49, p. 441, above.
7 See Part VII, ch. 41, above.

PART XI

WHY STUDY HISTORY?

53 The nature of historical thought

1 'The consciousness of each of us is evolution looking at itself and reflecting': Pierre Teilhard de Chardin, *The Phenomenon of Man*, London, Collins, 1959, p. 221.

2 Compare Part I, ch. 4, pp. 46-7, above.
3 A. L. Kroeber, *The Nature of Culture*, Chicago, University Press, 1952, p. 70.
4 Kroeber (see n. 3), p. 79.
5 M. R. Cohen, *The Meaning of Human History*, La Salle, Open Court Publishing Company, 1947, p. 42.
6 Cohen (see n. 5), pp. 289-90.
7 H. W. B. Joseph, *An Introduction to Logic*, 2nd revised edition, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1916, p. 401.
8 *The Social Sciences in Historical Study*, New York, Social Science Research Council, 1954, p. 95.
9 L. von Mises, *Theory and History*, London, Cape, 1958, p. 74.
10 E. H. Carr, *What is History?*, London, Macmillan, 1961, p. 59.
11 Pieter Geyl, *Debates with Historians*, London, Batsford, 1955, p. 140.
12 M. C. D'Arcy, *The Sense of History*, London, Faber and Faber, 1959, p. 48.
13 *The Social Sciences in Historical Study* (see n. 8), p. 131.
14 Carr (see n. 10), pp. 5-6.
15 G. Stedman Jones, 'English Historians' in *New Left Review*, November-December 1967, p. 42.
16 Stedman Jones (see n. 15), p. 42.
17 Leopold von Ranke, *Geschichte der germanischen und romanischen Völker 1494-1535* I, Anhang: 'Zur Kritik neuerer Geschichtsschreiber'.
18 Carr (see n. 10), pp. 114-15.
19 Christopher Dawson, *The Dynamics of World History*, London, Sheed and Ward, 1957, p. 287.
20 Dawson (see n. 19), p. 295.
21 Carr (see n. 10), p. 126.
22 von Mises (see n. 9), p. 93.
23 See Part IV, ch. 20, above.
24 George Meredith, *Modern Love*, first quoted in Part IV, ch. 21, p. 161, above.
25 In Part IV, ch. 20, p. 154, and Part V, ch. 30, pp. 243-4, above.
26 Friedrich Engels, *Socialism Utopian and Scientific*, London, Swan Sonnenschein, 1892, p. 82; quoted in R. C. Zaehner, *Dialectical Christianity and Christian Materialism*, London, Oxford University Press, 1971, p. 45.
27 Friedrich Engels, *Anti-Dühring*, London, Lawrence and Wishart, 1934, pp. 128-9; quoted in Zaehner (see n. 26), pp. 59-60.
28 Phil. ii. 7, as translated in the Revised Version.

54 Historians in action

1 See C. F. Volney, 'Les Ruines', in *Œuvres Complètes*, Paris, Didot, 1860, pp. 12-13.
2 Ibn Khaldun, *Muqaddimah, An Introduction to History*; English translation by F. Rosenthal, 3 vols., London, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1958.
3 See H. Grote, *The Personal Life of George Grote*, London, John Murray, 1873, p. 224.

- 4 Ibn Khaldun (see n. 2), I, ch. 3, §1, p. 313: 'Royal authority and large dynastic power are attained only through a group and group feeling'; I, ch. 3, §6, pp. 322-7: 'Religious propaganda cannot materialise without group feeling'.
- 5 Ibn Khaldun (see n. 2), I, ch. 2, §26, pp. 305-6.
- 6 Ibn Khaldun (see n. 2), I, ch. 3, §4, pp. 319-20.
- 7 Ibn Khaldun (see n. 2), I, ch. 3, §5, pp. 320-2.
- 8 Rosalind Murray.
- 9 Heb. xii. 1.
- 10 Geoffroi de Villchardouin, *Conquête de Constantinople*, text and translation by N. de Wailly, 3rd edition, Paris, Didot, 1882, p. 72.
- 11 Bernal Diaz de Castillo, *The Discovery and Conquest of Mexico, 1517-21*; English translation by A.P. Maudslay, London, Routledge, 1928, pp. 297-310.
- 12 Acts xix. 29-41.
- 13 See Josephus's preface to his *Contra Apionem* I, 47-50.
- 14 See Josephus's preface to *De Bello Judaico* I, 1-16.
- 15 Ibn-al-Tiqtaqa, *Al-Fakhrī*; Arabic text edited by H. Dercenbourg, Paris, Bouillon, 1895; French translation of this edition by Émile Amar, in *Archives Marocaines*, xvi, Paris, Ernest Leroux, 1910.
- 16 Saint Augustine, *Retractiones (Reconsiderations)* II, ch. 43.
- 17 Thucydides I, 1.
- 18 Thucydides I, 22.
- 19 Polybius I, 1.
- 20 'Ala ad-Din 'Ata Malik Juvayni, *The History of the World-Conqueror*; English translation by J.A. Boyle, 2 vols., Manchester, University Press, 1958, of Muhammad Qazvini's edition of the Persian text of the *Ta'rikh-i-Jahan Gusha*, 3 vols., London, Luzac, 1912, 1916, 1937. There is an incomplete edition, by E.M. Quatremère, of the Persian text of Rashid-ad-Din, *Jami'-al-Tawarikh (A Comprehensive Collection of Histories)*, Paris, Imprimerie Royale, 1836.
- 21 John Murray (editor), *The Autobiographies of Edward Gibbon*, London, Murray, 1896, pp. 405-6 (Memoir D). Compare p. 302 (Memoir E) and the slightly variant account of the same experience on p. 270 (Memoir C).
- 22 Read the moving account of Gibbon's feelings on this second eventful occasion in Murray (see n. 21), pp. 333-4 (Memoir E).
- 23 Murray (see n. 21), pp. 270-1 (Memoir C), and p. 406 (Memoir D).
- 24 Murray (see n. 21), p. 284 (Memoir C), and p. 411 (Memoir D).
- 25 The recognition that the history of the Western Civilization is parallel and comparable to the history of the antecedent Hellenic Civilization is, of course, no more than an observation that Western history has actually followed the same course so far. It does not commit the observer to the dogma that this repetition was inevitable. On this point see ch. 53, p. 488, above.
- 26 Homer, *Iliad* IV, 164-5.
- 27 Polybius XXXVIII, 22, reconstructed from Appian's paraphrase in *Roman Studies*, 'The Book of Africa', ch. 132.
- 28 Herodotus VII, 10; quoted in Part IV, ch. 22, p. 167, above.
- 29 James Shirley, *The Contention of Ajax and Ulysses* I, iii.
- 30 *Bhagavadgita* XI.
- 31 John iii. 16.
- 32 Ps. xix. 1.
- 33 Saint Francis of Assisi, *Laudes Creaturarum*, I, 5.
- 34 Qur'an x. 4.
- 35 Goethe, *Faust*, II, 12108-9: 'The ineffable - why, here, this is accomplished'; quoted in Part II, ch. 13, p. 109, above.